Synergism between paracetamol and nonsteroidal anti-inflammatory drugs in experimental acute pain

Hugo F. Miranda a,*, Margarita M. Puig b, Juan Carlos Prieto a, Gianni Pinardi a

a Pharmacology Program, ICBM, Faculty of Medicine, University of Chile, Clasificador 70.000, Santiago 7, Chile
b Department of Anesthesiology, Hospital del Mar, Paseo Marítimo 25, 08003 Barcelona, Spain

Abstract

The antinociception induced by the intraperitoneal coadministration of combinations of paracetamol with the nonsteroidal anti-inflammatory drugs (NSAIDs) diclofenac, ibuprofen, ketoprofen, meloxicam, metamizol, naproxen, nimesulide, parecoxib and piroxicam was studied by isobolographic analysis in the acetic acid abdominal constriction test of mice (writhing test). The effective dose that produced 50% antinociception (ED50) was calculated from the log dose–response curves of fixed ratio combinations of paracetamol with each NSAID. By isobolographic analysis, this ED50 was compared to the theoretical additive ED50 calculated from the ED50 of paracetamol and of each NSAID alone obtained from ED50 dose–response curves. As shown by isobolographic analysis, all the combinations were synergistic, the experimental ED50s being significantly smaller than the theoretically calculated ED50s. The results of this study demonstrate potent interactions between paracetamol and NSAIDs and validate the clinical use of combinations of these drugs in the treatment of pain conditions.

Keywords: Antinociception; NSAIDs; Paracetamol; Synergy; Abdominal constriction test; Writhing test; Isobologram

1. Introduction

The combination of analgesics of proven efficacy is a strategy intended to achieve one or more therapeutic goals, such as facilitating patient compliance, simplifying prescribing, improving efficacy without increasing adverse effects or decreasing adverse effects without loss of efficacy (Raffa, 2001; Hyllested et al., 2002). In certain cases, the coadministration of antinociceptive agents results in synergistic effects and the doses of the individual drugs can be substantially reduced (Maves et al., 1994; Salazar et al., 1995; Fairbanks and Wilcox, 1999; Kolesnikov et al., 2002; Miranda and Pinardi, 2004).

The antinociceptive action of nonsteroidal anti-inflammatory drugs (NSAIDs) is primarily due to the inhibition of prostaglandin biosynthesis through the inhibition of cyclooxygenase enzymes: COX-1 (constitutive) and COX-2 (inducible in inflammatory processes), even if alternative mechanisms have to be considered (Mitchell and Warner, 1999; Smith et al., 2000; Miranda et al., 2002; Warner and Mitchell, 2004). However, the absolute separation between the physiological and pathological roles of COX-1 and COX-2 is becoming less tenable and indeed their activities overlap to a considerable degree (Wallace, 1999). On the other hand, the mechanism of action of one of the most widely used analgesics, paracetamol or acetaminophen, remains largely unknown and at most the drug is considered to be an atypical NSAID, since it is a weak inhibitor of COXs (Botting, 2003). The following mechanisms have been postulated to explain paracetamol-induced...

* Corresponding author. Tel.: +56 2 678 6237; fax: +56 2 737 2783. E-mail address: hmiranda@med.uchile.cl (H.F. Miranda).
analgesia: selective inhibition of cyclooxygenase activity in the CNS, interaction with spinal 5-HT₃ receptors, interference with spinal substance P receptors or inhibition of neurons excited by substance P, activation of suprasegmental descending inhibitory pathways, increase in pituitary β-endorphin secretion, direct effects on neuronal membrane potentials (Bannwarth et al., 1995; Pelissier et al., 1995; Pini et al., 1996; Raffa and Codd, 1996; Breivik et al., 1999).

NSAIDs and paracetamol are drugs widely used to treat moderate to mild pain, but they are often inadequate against severe pain. Clinical studies on patients with musculoskeletal conditions, dental pain or postoperative pain have shown that combinations of paracetamol and NSAIDs may provide additive pain-relief (Altman, 2004). However, a detailed evaluation of different combinations of paracetamol with commonly used NSAIDs has not been reported. The purpose of the present study was to assess the nature of the interaction between the systemic administration of combinations of paracetamol and several NSAIDs in a rodent model of visceral pain. A broad number of clinical relevant NSAIDs are included because they are the most frequently used agents for the treatment of pain (Moiniche et al., 2003; Rømsing and Moiniche, 2004).

2. Materials and methods

2.1. Animals

Male CF-1 mice (28–30 g), housed on a 12 h light–dark cycle at 22 ± 2 °C and with access to food and water ad libitum, were used. Experiments were performed in accordance with current Guidelines for The Care of Laboratory Animals and Ethical Guidelines for investigation of experimental pain approved by the Animal Care and Use Committee of the Faculty of Medicine, University of Chile. Animals were acclimatized to the laboratory for at least 2 h before testing, were used only once during the protocol and were killed by cervical dislocation immediately after the algesiometric test. The number of animals was kept at a minimum compatible with consistent effects of the drug treatments.

2.2. Measurement of analgesic activity

Analgesic activity was assessed by the acetic acid abdominal constriction test (writhing test), a chemical visceral pain model (Hayashi and Takemori, 1971). Mice were injected i.p. with 10 mL/kg of 0.6% acetic acid solution 30 min after the i.p. administration of the drugs, a time at which preliminary experiments showed occurrence of the maximum effect. A writhing is characterized by a wave of contraction of the abdominal musculature followed by the extension of the hind limbs. The number of writhes in a 5 min period was counted, starting 5 min after acetic acid administration. Antinociceptive activity was expressed as percent inhibition of the usual number of writhes observed in control animals in this study.

2.3. Control animals

Physiological salt solution (10 mL/kg) was injected intraperitoneally (i.p.) or given orally and control animals were run interspersed concurrently with the drug treatments, which prevented the controls being run on a single group of mice at one time (19.7 ± 0.28, n = 92 i.p.; 20.1 ± 0.33, n = 12 p.o.).

2.4. Protocol

Dose–response curves for the antinociceptive effect of diclofenac, ibuprofen, ketoprofen, meloxicam, metamizol, naproxen, nimesulide, paracetamol, parecoxib, and piroxicam were obtained using at least six animals at each of at least four doses. The drugs were injected intraperitoneally. Dose–response curves were also obtained by the oral administration of paracetamol and diclofenac. A least-squares linear regression analysis of the log dose–response curves allowed the calculation of the dose that produced 50% of antinociception (ED₅₀) for each drug. A dose–response curve was also obtained by the intraperitoneal coadministration of paracetamol with each NSAID in fixed ratio combinations of fractions of their respective ED₅₀ values: 1/2, 1/4, 1/8, 1/16 (ratio values given in Table 2). A dose–response curve for the combination of paracetamol and diclofenac administered orally by gavage was also obtained with the same scheme. Isobolographic analysis was used to determine drug interactions. The method has been described previously in detail (Miranda et al., 2002). Supra-additivity or synergistic effect is defined as the effect of a drug combination that is higher and statistically different (ED₅₀ significantly lower) than the theoretically calculated equieffect of a drug combination with the same proportions. If the ED₅₀ values are not statistically different, the effect of the combination is additive and additivity means that each constituent contributes with its own potency to the total effect. The interaction index was calculated as experimental ED₅₀/theoretical ED₅₀. If the value is close to 1, the interaction is additive. Values lower than 1 are an indication of the magnitude of supra-additive or synergistic interactions and values higher than 1 correspond to sub-additive or antagonistic interactions (Tallarida, 2001).

2.5. Drugs

The drugs were freshly dissolved in a physiological salt solution. Paracetamol was provided by Bristol-Myers-Squibb, France. The NSAIDs were provided by local pharmaceutical companies: diclofenac by Novartis Chile S.A., ibuprofen by Laboratorio Chile S.A., ketoprofen by Rhone-Poulenc Rorer, meloxicam and naproxen by Laboratorios Saval S.A., metamizol by Sanderson S.A., nimesulide by Grünenthal Chilena Ltda, parecoxib and piroxicam by Pfizer Chile. Doses were expressed on the basis of the salts.

2.6. Statistical analysis

Results are presented as means ± SEM or as ED₅₀ values with 95% confidence limits (95% CL). Isobolographic calculations were performed with the program Pharm Tools Pro (version 1.27, The McCary Group Inc.), based on Tallarida (2000). The statistical difference between theoretical and experimental
values was assessed by Student’s t test for independent means and P values less than 0.05 (P < 0.05) were considered significant.

3. Results

3.1. Antinociception induced by paracetamol and NSAIDs

The i.p. administration of paracetamol, diclofenac, ibuprofen, ketoprofen, meloxicam, metamizol, naproxen, nimesulide, parecoxib and piroxicam showed dose-dependent antinociceptive effects with different potencies in the abdominal constriction test of mice. In Fig. 1, data showing dose–response curves obtained for several NSAIDs injected intraperitoneally (A) and for diclofenac and paracetamol given by the oral route (p.o., B) are displayed as an example. The curves were statistically parallel. The ED50 values and 95% CL for the antinociceptive effects of i.p. paracetamol and NSAIDs are shown in Table 1.

3.2. Interactions between paracetamol and NSAIDs

The antinociceptive activity of the i.p. coadministration of fixed ratio combinations of ED50 fractions of each NSAID with paracetamol was assessed by calculating the ED50 of the mixtures from the corresponding dose–response curves.

The isobolographic analysis of all combinations of NSAIDs with paracetamol, administered i.p., resulted

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Drugs</th>
<th>ED50 mg/kg i.p.</th>
<th>CL</th>
<th>ED50 mg/kg p.o.</th>
<th>CL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ibuprofen</td>
<td>0.8</td>
<td>0.12–6.1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parecoxib</td>
<td>1.6</td>
<td>1.0–2.6</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meloxicam</td>
<td>6.5</td>
<td>4.9–8.4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nimesulide</td>
<td>7.6</td>
<td>5.8–9.8</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Diclofenac</td>
<td>8.1</td>
<td>5.7–10.8</td>
<td>17.9</td>
<td>17.6–18.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Piroxicam</td>
<td>8.5</td>
<td>6.4–11.2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Metamizol</td>
<td>28.5</td>
<td>21.8–37.6</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ketoprofen</td>
<td>30.3</td>
<td>25.5–36.1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Naproxen</td>
<td>46.4</td>
<td>35.7–60.5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paracetamol</td>
<td>49.4</td>
<td>33.4–59.1</td>
<td>127.2</td>
<td>112.2–143.6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Values are ranked in descending order of potency.
in synergistic interactions of different magnitude, as can be seen in Figs. 2–4. The synergy was also present when the drug combination was administered orally (Fig. 5). Table 2 shows the theoretical additive and the experimental observed ED$_{50}$ values for the combinations, with their 95% CL and their fixed ratios. Furthermore, the interaction index values of the i.p. combinations demonstrated the following rank of potencies: nimesulide/paracetamol > naproxen/paracetamol > diclofenac/paracetamol > metamizol/paracetamol > ibuprofen/paracetamol > meloxicam/paracetamol > piroxicam/paracetamol > parecoxib/paracetamol > ketoprofen/paracetamol (Table 3).

4. Discussion

The intraperitoneal coadministration of paracetamol with the following NSAIDs, diclofenac, ibuprofen, ketoprofen, meloxicam, metamizol, naproxen, nimesulide, parecoxib and piroxicam, produced a dose-dependent antinociceptive effect in the chemical viscero-somatic assay of the acetic acid abdominal constriction test. The oral administration of paracetamol and diclofenac showed similar results. The parallelism of the dose-response curves is consistent with a common mechanism of action. These results confirm previous findings in which either paracetamol or the above-mentioned NSAIDs showed antinociceptive activity in this algesiometric test (Miranda et al., 2001, 2002, 2003; Pinardi et al., 2001; Botting, 2003; Miranda and Pinardi, 2004).

Every combination tested showed a synergic interaction. The differences in the magnitude of the observed
interactions with the different NSAIDs, expressed by the interaction index, may be related with their COX selectivity, the potency of COX inhibition, pharmacokinetic properties or with additional mechanisms of action. Compared to the salicylates, NSAIDs are highly lipophilic substances able to cross the blood–brain barrier (Bannwarth et al., 1989; Mehanna, 2003) and this factor does not seem to contribute significantly to the interaction. There is no evident relationship between NSAIDs ED50 values (Table 1) reflecting relative potency and the interaction index. COX-2 selectivity (parecoxib > meloxicam > nimesulide, Warner and Mitchell, 2004) may be inversely related to the interaction index (Table 3), but this apparent relationship needs further studies. Additional mechanisms of action other than COX inhibition may strongly influence the interaction.

NSAIDs are eliminated primarily by hepatic glucuronidation and an inverse relationship may exist between glucuronidation and NSAIDs’ efficacy, since an increase in the metabolism of these drugs results in a decrease of their pharmacological effect. The relative rates of NSAIDs glucuronidation are ketoprofen > ibuprofen > diclofenac > naproxen (Kuehl et al., 2005). This order of metabolic inactivation seems to be inversely related with the strength of the interaction index observed, since ketoprofen has the higher value and naproxen the lowest (Table 3).

The findings of the present work are important, because they are concordant with several clinical studies in which, in different surgical procedures, the combinations of paracetamol with ketoprofen or diclofenac were associated with lower pain scores than paracetamol alone (Hyllested et al., 2002). Clinical information comparing the degree of analgesia induced by paracetamol/NSAIDs combinations versus that induced by the NSAIDs alone, however sparse the available data might be, suggests that standard doses of paracetamol enhance the analgesic efficacy when added to ketoprofen, diclofenac or naproxen (Seideman, 1993; Breivik et al., 1999).

The analgesic effect of NSAIDs may not simply reflect a common mechanism of action, namely inhibition of prostaglandin biosynthesis (Vane et al., 1998; Smith et al., 2000; Chandrasekharan et al., 2002; Warner and Mitchell, 2004). Additional mechanisms have been suggested for the antinociceptive effect of different NSAIDs (Granados-Soto et al., 1995; Cashman, 1996; Papworth et al., 1999; Miranda et al., 2001). It is interesting to note that COX-3, a splice variant of COX-1, was considered to be the central site of action of paracetamol, but this selective interaction is unlikely to be clinically relevant (Graham and Scott, 2005) and the mechanism of paracetamol-induced analgesia in some way must affect COX-1 and/or COX-2.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Combinations</th>
<th>ED50 (95% CL) mg/kg i.p.</th>
<th>Ratio NSAID:PARA</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Theoretical</td>
<td>Experimental</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Naproxen/paracetamol</td>
<td>47.9 (35.3–64.9)</td>
<td>13.9* (9.9–18.3)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Metamizol/paracetamol</td>
<td>38.9 (30.7–49.3)</td>
<td>13.8* (10.3–18.8)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Piroxicam/paracetamol</td>
<td>28.9 (21.4–39.0)</td>
<td>11.9* (8.8–17.1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Diclofenac/paracetamol</td>
<td>28.8 (20.6–40.1)</td>
<td>7.4* (4.4–15.4)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nimesulide/paracetamol</td>
<td>28.5 (20.8–38.9)</td>
<td>7.4* (4.4–10.6)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meloxicam/paracetamol</td>
<td>27.9 (20.8–37.5)</td>
<td>11.4* (8.3–16.5)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parecoxib/paracetamol</td>
<td>26.5 (19.2–33.8)</td>
<td>12.2* (10.0–14.8)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ketoprofen/paracetamol</td>
<td>39.3 (33.5–47.4)</td>
<td>20.4* (15.8–25.6)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ibuprofen/paracetamol</td>
<td>25.1 (19.2–32.8)</td>
<td>9.6* (8.3–11.1)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Combinations</th>
<th>ED50 (95% CL) mg/kg p.o.</th>
<th>Ratio NSAID:PARA</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Theoretical</td>
<td>Experimental</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Diclofenac/paracetamol</td>
<td>72.6 (63.3–83.1)</td>
<td>32.3* (21.6–53.3)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*P < 0.05.
(Schwab et al., 2003). The study of Koppert et al. (2004) supports the assumption that additional mechanisms are involved in the antihyperalgesic action of paracetamol, since this drug is a nonspecific and weak inhibitor of COX-3. Recent data from Lucas et al. (2005) suggest that paracetamol interferes only with the oxidation state of COX-3. A mechanism of action (Schwab et al., 2003) supports the assumption that additional mechanisms are probably implicated in the antinociceptive activities of paracetamol and of NSAIDs, many of them at central levels, all of which contribute to the synergies of the combinations, and justify the differences in the interaction index of paracetamol/NSAID mixtures observed in the present work. The mechanisms responsible for the synergism in the analgesic activity of paracetamol/NSAID combinations are not clear; however, according to the information in the literature, different systems are partially involved and further experiments are required to completely characterize the pharmacological basis of the synergic effect.

In conclusion, the data of the present study demonstrated that paracetamol combined with NSAIDs produces a supra-additive or synergic analgesic effect. It may be noted that the doses of paracetamol and NSAIDs are very small and if they are compared with those referred in the literature, it is possible to suggest that the combinations of paracetamol and NSAIDs will be effective for the clinical treatment of pain. In addition, it is demonstrated that the effect of the combinations paracetamol/NSAIDs is superior to that of either component alone. Therefore, these mixtures are a viable alternative to clinical pain management, especially because the low doses of the components may be a potential index of lower incidence of adverse effects.

**Acknowledgements**

This work was partially supported by Project No. 1040873 from FONDECYT, Chile, and by a grant from Fondo de Investigaciones Sanitarias # 03/0245, Madrid, Spain. The expert technical assistance of J. López and A. Correa is gratefully acknowledged.

**References**


Fairbanks CA, Wilcox GL. Spinal antinociceptive synergism between morphine and clonidine persists in mice made acutely or chronically tolerant to morphine. J Pharmacol Exp Ther 1999;288:1107–16.


